ACADEMIC PROGRAM REVIEW (APR)

(Part A)

SECTION A: Introduction

1. List your name, name of the program coordinator (if different from your name), academic department/college, academic program, and academic year of the APR
   Dr. Randy C. Walls, PTH Committee Coordinator
   AGTS
   Master of Divinity
   2019-20

2. Briefly describe the program, identifying any subunits and the specific role each plays at Evangel University (EU). A table or chart would be sufficient.
   The M.Div. prepares students for pastoral and other vocational ministries in the church, teaching ministries in local Districts and churches, and for advanced graduate programs in Bible and Theology (e.g., Ph.D.), and ministry (e.g., D.Min.). The M.Div. degree requires 78 credits, three years, of study.
   With concentration options in military and institutional chaplaincy, the MDiv provides University students with the opportunity to prepare for these arenas of service by providing the requisite degree program for military and institutional based ministry contexts.
   Two additional concentrations provide students with proficiencies in biblical preaching, as well as an intercultural emphasis in Islamic studies.

3. Briefly describe the staffing in a manner that illustrates the organization of staff and that their credentials are appropriate. A table or chart would be sufficient.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instructor Name</th>
<th>Degree(s) and Role</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Battaglia, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Bradford, D.Min. Psy.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roger Cotton, Th.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deborah Gill, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tim Hager, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Hernando, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>David Hillis, D.Min.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Jaffe, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anita Koeshell, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Lewis, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris McGough, M.A.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daniel Morrison, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johan Mostert, D.Phil.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lois Oltena, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doug Oss, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Melody Palm, Psy.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Railey, D.Th.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DeLonin Rance, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valerie Rance, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandon Schmily, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles Self, Ph.D.</td>
<td>Instructor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Smallwood, D.Min.</td>
<td>PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.P. Vick, D.Min.</td>
<td>Instructor, PTH Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Randy C. Walls, D.Min.</td>
<td>Instructor, PTH Committee Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Randy C. Walls, D.Min.</td>
<td>Instructor, PTH Committee Coordinator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Identify key stakeholders (students, alumni, employers) that require ongoing attention from the program.
   A/G Chaplaincy Endorsement Office
   A/G District Ministerial Credentialing Offices
   Alumni-led and network related local A/G churches

SECTION B: Identity: Mission, Values and Strategic Plan

5. Explain how the program advances Evangel’s mission, values, EU 20 Outcomes, and/or strategic plans.
   With its sole focus on preparing men and women for vocational ministry, the MDiv embodies the mission of EU “to educate and equip Spirit-empowered servants of God who impact the Church and society globally.”
   The MDiv program also embodies the four EU values of truth, integrity, service and community through a strong foundation of bible/theology courses which equip students to understand God’s revealed person and plan and the implications for vocational service in contemporary ministry contexts. Additionally, the curriculum provides a set of courses oriented toward spiritual passion, personal wholeness, relational integrity, vocational clarity and professional competency. These program characteristics not only embody EU values, they fully support the academic innovation and spiritual vitality emphases of the EU strategic plan.
   With the exception of a few content specific outcomes, the MDiv program courses address and/or assess the EU 20 Outcomes.
6. Describe how the program serves, supports, or collaborates with one or more other EU program(s) to help students succeed.

The core bible/theology courses in the MDiv program are part of a shared learning experience across the other four masters degrees in the AGTS program offerings. As such, MDiv students interface and interact with all other AGTS students in classroom-based and/or online-based theological training.

Additionally, the five of the eight core courses in the Practical Theology section of the MDiv program are shared learning experiences with the Master of Leadership and Ministry (MLM) program, as well as other select masters programs that offer electives credits in which students can take at least one of the eight PTH core courses.

7. Explain any changes or improvements that have been implemented since the last APR.

Based on the 2015 student learning assessment that identified less than mastery level performance in theological research and writing by the MDiv students in several of the program courses, the PTH Committee, along with the BTH and GMD Committees, revised the MDiv curriculum to require that all students take RES 531 Theological Research and Writing. In order to maintain the program at 78 credit hours, one of the four electives courses were eliminated, making the total number of electives credits offered in the program at 9 credits instead of 12 credits. This left all of the other learning proficiencies in place in the core curriculum.

Additionally, in the Fall of 2017, the course PTH 558 Journey Toward Personal Wholeness was revised, renumbered and renamed to PTH 522 Identity & Calling of the Spiritual Leader in order to more fully align with the overall pastoral leadership development outcomes of the MDiv program.

In the Fall of 2018, the four primary core PTH courses, PTH 522, 557, 559 & 653, were sequenced according to course content and progressive pastoral leadership development as follows: Students must take PTH 522 first, followed by PTH 557, followed by PTH 559, followed by PTH 653. Each preceding course is thus a pre-requisite for the course which immediately follows it in this listing.

8. Describe any adverse effect that the elimination of the program would have on EUs ability to help students succeed.

The primary and most serious effect would be the students who are seeking endorsement for and accession into military and institutional chaplaincy contexts. The MDiv is the required or preferred masters degree program for all of these ministry vocations.

Additionally, students seeking to pursue a terminal degree in bible/theology or ministry would have to take an alternate education path to meet standard admission requirements for post graduate studies.

Finally, the MDiv offers the most thorough formal education experience for those seeking service in localized ministry contexts.

SECTION C: Relevance

9. Chart enrollment trends and identify the extent to which there is a discernible demand or need for the program and how successfully the program meets it.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Year</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2015-2016</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016-2017</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017-2018</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2018-2019</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While the number of MDiv students has declined over the last few years, this program still serves those students wishing to enter military/institutional chaplaincy ministries. In order to continue the level of support that AGTS provides for the A/G national chaplaincy endorsement office, we need to continue to provide the resources necessary to maintain the MDiv program. AGTS chaplaincy students and the national representative for A/G endorsement affirm the quality of the AGTS MDiv program. Field-based testimonials from MDiv alums who are chaplains identify the quality and effectiveness of the AGTS MDiv curriculum in preparing them for chaplaincy service.

While AGTS chaplaincy candidate students often enter their respective fields of ministry having completed the current 78 credit hours of study, AGTS offers learning opportunities for these students to earn an additional 12 credit hours in order to meet the 90 credit hours that some branches of military service may require for a Master of Divinity.

Additionally, the MDiv program serves as the primary academic standard for admission into doctoral level studies not only at AGTS, but across the nation and around the world for institutions offering postgraduate studies in religion.

In summary, the MDiv program at AGTS meets or exceeds the standards for chaplaincy ministry and/or doctoral level studies.

How is stakeholder interest expected to evolve in the future, e.g.: will it decline, remain the same, increase?

As long as the United States government armed forces continue to provide religious services to its military personnel, and thus continue to require its chaplains to attain a Master of Divinity degree in order to meet candidacy qualifications, the AGTS MDiv program will well-serve this ministry need.
Furthermore, although some institutional chaplaincy contexts do not “require” a Master of Divinity, many of them still do. So, AGTS will continue to meet the candidacy requirements for these students in its MDiv program.

Additionally, students seeking to enter postgraduate studies still need to acquire a MDiv degree in order to meet the application/admission standards for their respective terminal degrees.

Identify the expected impact on the program.

These demands, driven by consistent student enrollment, should enable AGTS to continue its Master of Divinity program.

10. Explain how the program has evolved in response to changing demands/needs of today’s students or other stakeholders.

As noted above, in Section C. 9., AGTS offers chaplaincy candidates an option to earn up to 90 credit hours in order to prepare them for candidacy equality with chaplains from other denominations whose MDiv requirements meet or exceed the 90 credit hours. Additionally, AGTS offers 6 electives courses (a potential of 18 credit hours total) in pastoral counseling and related courses that further equip chaplaincy candidates with the knowledge base and skills competencies for their pastoral care praxes.

11. List the program’s strengths (attributes of the program that are helpful to achieving program objectives) and weaknesses (attributes that are harmful to achieving objectives).

What are the strengths of the AGTS MDiv program?

- Well-rounded:
  - academics – biblical languages, Church history, biblical introductions, theology, Bible
  - spiritual formation,
  - practical theology.
- A small class environment (the size of the school) that enhances the interpersonal relationship between instructor and student; Mentoring that takes place within the program
- Breadth of courses with strong integration of Bible-Theology, Practical Theology and Missions with a Pentecostal lens; Integration of theory and practice, faith and learning
- Possibility for quality concentrations—expository preaching, Chaplaincy and Islamic studies
- Scholar practitioner faculty
- Diverse delivery systems
- Close denominational affiliation

What are the weaknesses of the AGTS MDiv program?

- Right now it lacks a “certified counseling program emphasis” that can be applied to the MDIV program as a major!
- Short for recommended 90+ hour MDiv for military chaplain candidates
- No ethics courses embedded
- Both biblical languages are not mandated
- Lack of full time PTH faculty
- Lack of endowment to scholarship students
- The number of intercultural/missiological courses could be increased
- The size of the faculty
  - Limited diversity of areas of expertise, perspectives, etc.
- Smaller number of hours required for biblical language development
- The limited number of actual Bible courses

12. List the program’s opportunities (external conditions that are helpful to achieving program objectives) & threats (external conditions that are harmful to achieving objectives).

What are the opportunities that the AGTS MDiv program may not currently be taking addressing?

- Advertisement within the military community...such as the Army Times and Stars and Stripes publications. This could open up the possibility of hundreds of potential students with VA Educational benefits.
- Set up 90 hour MDiv with established internships in churches/ministries
- Ethics courses for military chaplain candidates
- CBTE MDiv
- An M.Div. in Spanish may serve a significant portion of AG constituents
- A 3 + 2 or a 4 + 2 program might attract students from sister schools; Allow for joint degrees within EU/AGTS
- International students are under recruited
- New Ecclesiology and what the church of the present and future might look like and how our students can lead in such movements.
- I’m always concerned for even more spiritual formation, especially in terms of Pentecostalism.

What are the threats that may inhibit the effectiveness of the AGTS MDiv program?
- Increased online competition from other seminaries as well as other MDiv degree programs from other AVG institutions.
- General ATS noted decline of MDivs in the US among Catholic and Mainline Protestant seminaries
- Except among the Korean AG, MDiv is not needed for credentialing
- Students may not be knowledgeable that all masters degrees are not created equal, i.e. MA in relation to the MDiv.
- Low enrollments; size of student body
- Budgetary issues
- Acquisition of appropriate visas
- Limited advertising, less recruitment,
- Retention of current faculty (due to reduction in retirement contributions, reduced promotions)
- Decreased professional development and travel funds
- Suspension of sabbaticals

13. Discuss how strengths/opportunities have been or can be used to overcome weaknesses/threats.

The continued engagement with the training of military chaplaincy candidates, and the network partnerships and resources related to this core group of MDiv students, continues to empower the program to equip students for effective service.

The offering of the MDiv program as a fully online learning experience (projected for Fall 2020 launch) should also engage a pool of potential students who do not want to or cannot complete a residential MDiv program.

SECTION D: Effectiveness

14. Attach your most recent PLO assessment data/results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcomes</th>
<th>Fall 2018</th>
<th>Spring 2019</th>
<th>Summer 2019</th>
<th>Cumulative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>PLOs</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>PLOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 1 - Discuss Bib Rev and Msn of God</td>
<td>53.00</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>44.00</td>
<td>3.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 2 - Bridging the Horizons</td>
<td>69.00</td>
<td>3.30</td>
<td>51.00</td>
<td>3.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 3 - Discuss Pentecostalism</td>
<td>12.00</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>20.00</td>
<td>3.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 4 - Discuss Issues and People in BTh</td>
<td>16.00</td>
<td>3.54</td>
<td>25.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 5 - Minister in Multi-Cult Society</td>
<td>30.00</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>13.00</td>
<td>3.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 6 - Compare Cultural Distinctives</td>
<td>27.00</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>13.00</td>
<td>3.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDiv 7 - Construct Methods for Growth</td>
<td>57.00</td>
<td>3.67</td>
<td>54.00</td>
<td>3.49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What evidence exists that the program helps students achieve learning outcomes?
Based on a 0 to 4 scale for student performance, a 3 demonstrates achievement of mastery level learning.
As the table above clearly identifies, average student performance in all nine of the program learning outcomes exceeds mastery level achievement.

What changes have been made since the last APR to ensure that outcomes are achieved?
As noted in Section B.7. above, the addition of the research and writing course suggests improvement in overall student performance since the last APR. Of note, the 2016 APR did not collect and collate data in the same way as the current assessment of student learning. Beginning Fall 2017, all data is collected and collated in the University learning management system (Course Commons), a Canvas™ software. Ongoing review of this collated data in annual student learning assessment and through the next program review cycle should provide more specific assessment data for student learning.
Also as noted in Section B.7. above, the sequencing of the PTH core courses should produce a more integrated curriculum and strong performance in student learning outcomes.

What have you learned from assessing the changes?
Performance levels in the PTH 556 Field Education Research Project, the summative project for the MDiv program, suggests improvements in both theological and professional research, as well as improved skills in academic writing.

15. Identify the source of professional standards that inform this program.
The Association of Theological Schools in the United States and Canada (ATS) has established a set of program standards for the Master of Divinity degree (ATS Degree Program Standard A) that governs the offering of this degree program at all of its member schools. As an ATS accredited seminary, AGTS follows the guidelines for this degree regarding the requirements for admission, matriculation, duration and assessment. This ATS standard requires that all schools establish an institutional mission-driven curriculum that addresses religious heritage, cultural contexts, personal and spiritual formation, and the capacity for ministerial and public leadership. Using a 78 credit hour curriculum, AGTS offers courses in church history, intercultural studies, bible/theology, preaching, discipleship, evangelism and personal and organizational leadership to demonstrate compliance with the professional standards established by ATS.
A review of the MDiv curriculum from five peer ATS schools demonstrates the compatibility and equity of the AGTS program:
1. Anderson University School of Theology @ 78 credit hours
2. Ashland Theological Seminary @ 80 credit hour hours
3. Bethel Seminary @ 78 credit hours
4. North Park Theological Seminary @ 90 credit hours
5. George W. Truett Theological Seminary @ 87 credit hours

Explain how those standards have been used to assess and maintain ongoing quality and relevance.
Based upon the ATS and Peer Seminary standards, AGTS has established nine program learning outcomes by which the curriculum of the MDiv degree is measured. An annual student learning assessment evaluation is done by the Practical Theology Committee (PTH), in consultation with the Bible/Theology Committee and Intercultural Studies Committee (ICS) to determine levels of student performance in the program courses. Using a curriculum map, each course in the program is aligned with one or more of the PLOs. Learning artifacts from each of these courses is used to measure this performance. Using an 84% baseline for demonstrating mastery level performance by students in the program, data is evaluated to determine how students perform in each course, as well as in each PLO. While there is some variance in course level performance, overall student learning demonstrates performance above mastery level standards for all PLOs.
Additionally, as part of the Academic Program Review which occurs every four years, the PTH Committee consults with an external cohort of stakeholders, including alumni, governance board members, denominational leadership and select lead pastors in order to have them review the curriculum and student performance in view of the changing dynamics of ministerial life and mission.
Through the two feedback mechanisms of student learning assessment and field-based consultation, the data strongly suggests that the AGTS MDiv program is meeting and/or exceeding the demands of preparing its students for effective vocational ministry.

16. Report and discuss the post-graduation placement of your graduates.
   Since the MDiv program is a masters degree oriented toward the preparation of program participants for vocational ministry, it is important to note that the polity of the General Council of the Assemblies of God, USA, the Seminary’s parent denomination, includes ministerial credentialing at a national level, but each local congregation exercises its autonomous right to select its pastoral leaders. As such, neither the Seminary nor the judicatory bodies of the General Council, have any oversight of the placement of ministers in local congregations. The only exception to this policy relates to local churches that do not meet the autonomous status, thus each judicatory district works to place credentialed ministers in these churches. However, the nature of these placements still involves a degree of local church participation, so the general rule for the Seminary’s input remains the same.
   Relative to the national credentialing of A/G ministers, however, the data set for MDiv graduates over the last five years is as follows:
   - 57 MDiv graduates are affiliated with the Assemblies of God
     - 40 of them are licensed/ordained with the A/G
     - Based upon available data, these 40 are serving as Military Chaplains, Local Church Pastoral Staff Members, Evangelists, Local Church Lead Pastors and Institutional Chaplains
     - There is no data available on the remaining 17 as to their credentialing status, nor their activity in ministerial positions
   - 6 MDiv graduates are affiliated with other denominations (No data on ministerial affiliation or activity)
     - 1 Evangelical Free Church
     - 1 International Ministerial Fellowship
     - 2 Non-denominational
     - 1 Other Pentecostal/Charismatic
     - 1 Vineyard, USA

17. Present and discuss any additional evidence of the program’s quality and success. Include evidence of stakeholder (students, alumni, employers) satisfaction along with evidence that the unit has reviewed it & used what they learned to improve the program.
   The Seminary Practical Theology Committee invited an external advisory committee to assist in the analysis of the AGTS MDiv program. The advisory committee was comprised of a recent MDiv graduate, a graduate of 10 or more years, a denominational judicatory officer, a retired military chaplain, a retired institutional chaplain and a local church pastor. The advisory committee received documentation on the academic program review, the MDiv curriculum, the catalog descriptions of the MDiv courses and the MDiv teaching faculty & PTH Committee SWOT analysis. They were asked to review these documents and conduct a SWOT analysis on them relative to their current ministry contexts in order to determine what, if any changes might be needed. Their responses were tabulated and reviewed by the PTH Committee as part of its overall assessment of the MDiv program.
   The external advisors analysis confirmed much of the SWOT analysis completed by the PTH Committee and Teaching Faculty. Of note, the advisors commended the program for its strong theological foundation and encouraged a continued commitment to this important part of the curriculum. The advisors also highlighted the need for continuing the program’s strong pastoral theology and praxis, including the program’s emphasis on counseling, leadership development and experiences in preparing sacerdotal and covenantal ceremonies.

18. If an A.A. degree is part of this program, describe how the changes to this program affect the A.A. degree.
   Not applicable.

SECTION E: Sustainability

19. What new revenue opportunities have been (or can be) beneficial to the program?
   Other than tuition, there is no other revenue generated for the MDiv program except the support funding from the scholarships noted below.

   Describe any supporting funding from subsidies, grants, fundraising, etc.
   Students in the MDiv program receive scholarship funding from three primary sources:
   1. Pentecostal Leadership Fund - A general scholarship fund for all AGTS students who meet specified qualifications.
20. To what extent does the program have the personnel, technological, and other resources it needs to meet its objectives?

AGTS has the personnel, faculty and resources necessary to move students through the Master of Divinity degree program from enrollment to graduation. The AGTS enrollment coordinator, partners with the larger EU enrollment team to walk prospective students through the admissions process. Once admitted, AGTS has a specified financial aid coordinator who works with the students on federal loan programs, institutional, designated and endowed scholarships to help fund their degree programs. Each MDiv student has an AGTS faculty advisor who assists them in progressing through the program curriculum each semester. The AGTS registrar and degree audit coordinator works to insure that students meet all the program requirements to make them eligible for graduation.

Additionally, the Seminary students access the EU technology portals for online advisement & academic registration, financial registration and the course learning management system. Skilled personnel oversee these technological resources from faculty advisement, to registration, to student account management, to digital learning assistance and supervision.

21. What efficiencies in the way the program operates are (or can be) beneficial to Evangel University as a whole?

The MDiv program offers the most comprehensive masters level learning experience for Seminary students. The curriculum for the program integrates the key academic disciplines of biblical/theological, missiological and pastoral studies. As such, the core curriculum of the MDiv program allows students from each of the three other AGTS masters degrees to participate in a program-diverse learning experience as each course may potentially include all four masters program students in a single learning environment. This overlap also eliminates the need for additional sections of courses and faculty for these diverse programs, thereby reducing the overall Seminary expenditures for student learning.

Additionally, the Seminary is beginning to explore new cross-discipline and integrative studies programs within the larger University program offerings to create opportunities for MDiv students to earn dual degrees, i.e. counseling, or concentrations, i.e. organizational leadership, business, etc.

SECTION F: Planning for the Future

22. Based on what you have learned from this review, including the SWOT conducted for the “Relevance” section (questions 8-12), identify 1 – 3 strategic objectives that will enable the program to further one or more of EU’s strategic goals in the next 5 years OR update and attach your strategic plan. For each objective, please include: Who is the driver responsible for meeting this objective? Who needs to be involved in accomplishing the objective? What strategy(s) will be used to achieve the objective? and When will this objective be accomplished?

- The most strategic approach the PTH Committee can pursue is the continued collaboration with the military and institutional chaplaincy endorsement agency. The continued scholarships provided for the MDiv students pursuing chaplaincy through this agency provides the most stable level of support for the ongoing recruiting and enrollment of MDiv students. Working with the Vice President and Dean of the Seminary, Dr. Tim Hager, the Committee will ensure that these students are being well-served in their learning experiences.

- The projected launch of the fully online MDiv program for Fall 2020 should also assist the PTH Committee in expanding the reach to potential students. The Committee will be responsible for the scheduling of online courses and the regular student learning and program assessments to insure that the online program meets the Seminary standards for excellence.